
From: Liao, Thomas [mailto:TLiao@sanleandro.org]
Sent: Friday, October 14, 2016 6:17 PM
To: Matt Maloney <mmaloney@mtc.ca.gov>
Subject: pba 2040 draft preferred scenario_ san leandro feedback

Hi Matt:

Thanks for giving us an opportunity to comment on the Draft Preferred Scenario for Plan Bay Area 2040. The City just approved its updated General Plan and EIR (www.sanleandro2035.org) in September 2016 after a 2 ½ year public process. The updated General Plan is in line with Plan Bay Area 2013 and ABAG 2013 projections in terms of household growth projections, but our jobs growth in the General Plan Update was more aggressive than PBA 2013/ABAG 2013. Note our General Plan Update covers a 20 year period from 2015-2035, but for the EIR we revised housing and jobs TAZ data for 2010-2040 (from the most current Alameda CTC Countywide Model) and then extrapolated data to fit our 2035 horizon year. San Leandro has about 80 TAZs.

Below are the City's comments on the Draft Preferred Scenario (see my attached Excel spreadsheet "Plan Bay Area 2040 SL Feedback):

- 1) Why did the PDA 2040 Draft Preferred Scenario household and jobs numbers decline substantially in 2010 and 2040 from PBA 2013 in the PDAs? For instance, households went from 8,050 to 4,700 in 2010 while jobs went from 13,240 to 9,750. Please clarify this discrepancy in the Final Preferred Scenario.
- 2) The City-wide household growth projections for 2010-2040 for the Draft Preferred Scenario seem to reflect or generally match the PBA 2013 and General Plan EIR projections. We are not sure what assumptions you all used to calculate this larger increase and where you all showed the additional jobs to occur. I've attached for your reference the 2010-2040 residential growth changes to Countywide Model TAZ data that we did for the General Plan EIR (specifically for transportation impact analysis). We found the 2010 TAZ housing totals and geographic distribution seemed correct to us, but you all may find this useful in re-assessing the housing projections for the PDAs.
- 3) In contrast, the Draft Preferred Scenario job growth numbers are substantially higher than PBA 2013 and the General Plan EIR TAZ projections. While we did not change the total jobs and total jobs by sector numbers in the TAZs, we did correct the geographic distribution of jobs where we found them to be factually inaccurate. Attached for your reference is the 2010-2040 jobs growth to the Countywide Model TAZ data for the General Plan EIR transportation impact analysis. Hopefully these TAZ numbers may be helpful to you all in re-assessing the jobs growth for San Leandro in the Draft Preferred Scenario. We look forward to seeing updated and reduced job growth numbers in the Final Preferred Scenario.

Please feel free to contact me if you or your colleagues have any questions. Thanks again to you all for your efforts on this important update.

Tom

Tom Liao, Deputy Community Development Director
City of San Leandro Community Development Dept.
835 East 14th St.
San Leandro, CA 94577
510-577-6003 (office)
510-577-6007 (fax)
e-mail: tliao@sanleandro.org
www.sanleandro.org

San Leandro Comments Re: Plan Bay Area 2040 Preferred Draft Scenario

	HH			Jobs		
	<u>2010</u>	<u>2040</u>	<u>Change</u>	<u>2010</u>	<u>2040</u>	<u>Change</u>
Plan Bay Area 2013						
<i>City-wide</i>	30,720	38,890	8,170	39,980	52,920	12,940
<i>PDA's</i>	8,050	13,820	5,770	13,240	21,220	7,980
Preferred Draft Scenario 2040						
<i>City-wide</i>	30,800	38,500	7,700	49,700	66,800	17,100
<i>PDA's</i>	4,700	11,700	7,000	9,750	11,000	1,250
General Plan Update EIR (2010-2040)*						
<i>City-wide</i>	31,476	38,153		39,588	53,818	14,230

	HH			Jobs		
	<u>2015</u>	<u>2035</u>		<u>2015</u>	<u>2035</u>	
General Plan Update (2015-2035)						
<i>City-wide</i>	31,315	36,685	5,370	43,400	55,500	12,100

* Based on revised TAZ data for 2010-2040 for General Plan Update & EIR (approved Sept 2016)

SPREADSHEET B: HOUSING UNIT FORECASTS: 2010 Baseline, 2010-2040 Growth, 2040 Forecast

(note: to calculate households in yr 2040, multiply # of housing units by 0.96 to account for vacancies)

ZONE	2010 Baseline			2010-2040 Increment			2040 Forecast		
	SF	MF	TOTAL	SF	MF	TOTAL	SF	MF	TOTAL
531	833	437	1270	8	78	87	841	515	1357
532	515	271	786	5	5	10	520	276	796
533	925	76	1001	9	9	19	934	85	1020
534	346	29	375	3	3	7	349	32	382
535	798	304	1102	8	8	16	806	312	1118
536	823	313	1136	8	8	16	831	321	1152
537	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
538	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
539	25	1	26	0	0	1	25	1	27
540	497	22	519	5	5	10	502	27	529
541	1545	67	1612	15	15	31	1560	82	1643
542	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
543	224	225	449	3	2	5	227	227	454
544	518	519	1037	5	5	10	523	524	1047
545	331	332	663	27	3	31	358	335	694
546	319	129	448	3	78	81	322	207	529
547	19	8	27	0	100	100	19	108	127
548	391	158	549	4	117	121	395	275	670
549	280	722	1002	3	201	204	283	923	1206
550	97	249	346	1	217	218	98	466	564
551	128	330	458	1	179	181	129	509	639
552	343	886	1229	3	323	327	346	1209	1556
553	26	67	93	0	0	1	26	67	94
554	1	2	3	0	0	0	1	2	3
555	229	16	245	2	2	5	231	18	250
556	247	17	264	2	2	5	249	19	269
557	315	22	337	3	3	6	318	25	343
558	213	15	228	2	2	4	215	17	232
559	323	22	345	3	43	46	326	65	391
560	1370	55	1425	28	14	41	1398	69	1466
561	222	56	278	6	2	8	228	58	286
562	189	48	237	3	2	5	192	50	242
563	400	101	501	10	29	39	410	130	540
564	322	63	385	26	57	83	348	120	468
565	225	44	269	2	2	5	227	46	274
566	297	58	355	3	3	6	300	61	361
567	363	71	434	5	4	8	368	75	442
568	190	140	330	2	2	4	192	142	334
569	201	148	349	2	78	80	203	226	429
570	170	125	295	3	2	4	173	127	299
571	411	302	713	4	52	56	415	354	769
572	433	147	580	4	79	84	437	226	664
573	317	109	426	3	61	64	320	170	490

ZONE	2010 Baseline			2010-2040 Increment			2040 Forecast		
	SF	MF	TOTAL	SF	MF	TOTAL	SF	MF	TOTAL
574	460	157	617	5	55	59	465	212	676
575	4	7	11	0	50	50	4	57	61
576	256	449	705	5	176	180	261	625	885
577	154	271	425	10	64	73	164	335	498
578	80	141	221	1	247	248	81	388	469
579	148	261	409	1	658	660	149	919	1069
580	72	126	198	17	300	316	89	426	514
581	222	391	613	2	123	125	224	514	738
582	5	8	13	0	696	696	5	704	709
583	15	25	40	0	0	0	15	25	40
584	625	221	846	6	6	13	631	227	859
585	129	46	175	1	1	3	130	47	178
586	235	83	318	2	579	582	237	662	900
587	528	187	715	365	27	393	893	214	1108
588	415	147	562	10	4	14	425	151	576
589	3	1	4	0	0	0	3	1	4
590	226	80	306	5	2	8	231	82	314
591	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
592	70	25	95	1	31	31	71	56	126
593	31	11	42	0	0	1	31	11	43
594	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
595	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
596	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
597	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
598	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
599	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
600	63	22	85	1	1	1	64	23	86
601	13	5	18	0	0	0	13	5	18
642	155	93	248	0	375	375	155	468	623
1468	399	141	540	15	4	19	414	145	559
1469	87	153	240	1	96	97	88	249	337
1470	575	203	778	6	14	20	581	217	798
1471	164	58	222	127	8	134	291	66	356
1472	187	76	263	19	2	21	206	78	284
1473	19	8	27	0	205	205	19	213	232
1474	19	8	27	0	320	320	19	328	347
1476	187	187	374	2	2	4	189	189	378
1477	106	106	212	1	1	2	107	107	214
CITYWIDE	21073	10403	31476	831	5846	6677	21904	16249	38153

TAZ 642 is partially in city and partially in county. Units in green font are in County and units in 2010-2040 growth inc. are in City

Totals without
TAZ 642's 248
housing units in
uninc. County 20918 10310 31228 831 5691 6584 21749 16156 37905

PLAN BAY AREA FORECASTS INDICATE 20% of the household growth between 2015 and 2040 occurs in 2035-40
Thus to "back in" to 2035 forecasts, each entry in the 2015-2040 increment above should be multiplied by 0.8

C: 2010-2040 EMPLOYMENT GROWTH INCREMENT

ZONE	2010-2040 GROWTH							NEW 2040 TOTALS						
	Retail	Service	Other	Ag	Mfg	Wholes	Total jobs, 2010-40	Retail	Service	Other	Ag	Mfg	Wholes	Total jobs, 2040
531	20	20	20	0	0	0	60	119	100	398	0	37	22	676
532	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	49	33	108	0	9	5	204
533	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	12	44	82	0	0	0	138
534	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	5	17	0	0	0	0	22
535	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	9	42	32	0	32	49	164
536	0	0	50	5	60	50	165	117	513	733	5	648	369	2385
537	0	0	40	5	75	100	220	132	460	648	5	488	330	2063
538	410	3140	885	0	0	0	4435	496	3198	982	0	41	22	4739
539	0	0	0	0	30	10	40	86	149	188	0	130	66	619
540	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	24	95	55	0	0	0	174
541	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	247	92	92	0	59	35	525
542	45	45	25	5	55	75	250	467	464	619	5	673	229	2457
543	0	0	25	5	95	100	225	197	178	277	5	359	462	1478
544	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	133	131	163	0	14	3	444
545	-10	0	0	0	0	0	-10	155	100	208	0	0	2	465
546	45	110	50	0	0	0	205	59	280	164	0	73	13	589
547	90	110	50	0	0	0	250	247	191	148	0	3	6	595
548	45	120	50	0	0	0	215	307	300	346	0	20	46	1019
549	90	90	20	0	20	5	225	149	221	751	0	81	117	1319
550	70	75	20	0	0	0	165	85	129	87	0	5	0	306
551	110	65	15	0	0	0	190	141	174	150	0	10	0	475
552	100	110	30	0	0	0	240	155	226	105	0	48	11	545
553	0	10	10	0	0	0	20	23	288	192	0	115	25	643
554	0	0	20	0	10	40	70	14	71	65	0	39	46	235
555	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	16	144	0	0	1	161
556	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	2	25	0	2	0	29
557	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	9	25	0	2	0	36
558	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	7	77	0	0	0	84
559	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	3	190	0	0	0	193
560	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	15	93	385	0	9	4	506
561	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	7	23	65	0	1	0	96
562	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	11	22	115	0	0	0	148
563	15	15	0	0	0	0	30	176	115	101	0	1	0	393
564	20	20	25	0	0	0	65	77	156	149	0	2	2	386
565	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	6	30	57	0	2	1	96
566	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	24	85	99	0	2	1	211
567	10	10	0	0	0	0	20	34	91	178	0	2	0	305
568	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	126	50	138	0	7	2	323
569	20	20	5	0	0	0	45	73	115	27	0	4	8	227
570	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	59	53	116	0	7	2	237
571	10	10	5	0	0	0	25	64	45	88	0	4	1	202
572	20	20	25	0	0	0	65	117	375	557	0	60	33	1142
573	15	15	5	0	0	0	35	66	357	651	0	71	42	1187
574	15	15	5	0	0	0	35	85	92	5	0	0	0	182

2010-2040 GROWTH								NEW 2040 TOTALS							
ZONE	Retail	Service	Other	Ag	Mfg	Wholes	Total jobs, 2010-40	Retail	Service	Other	Ag	Mfg	Wholes	Total jobs, 2040	
575	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	6	30	28	0	4	2	70	
576	65	60	15	0	0	0	140	118	172	125	0	15	7	437	
577	130	20	5	0	0	0	155	177	537	78	0	44	9	845	
578	65	25	25	0	0	0	115	216	155	112	0	10	6	499	
579	75	110	125	0	0	0	310	281	648	416	0	26	23	1394	
580	45	60	65	0	0	0	170	173	835	422	0	10	9	1449	
581	0	20	25	0	0	0	45	45	802	188	0	11	9	1055	
582	20	400	400	0	-6	-6	808	55	525	469	0	0	0	1049	
583	60	950	950	0	0	0	1960	87	1171	1074	0	12	10	2354	
584	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	10	6	48	0	15	8	87	
585	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	58	7	181	0	27	11	284	
586	45	350	350	0	-50	-50	645	78	364	423	0	0	1	866	
587	95	400	300	0	0	0	795	217	640	538	25	20	20	1460	
588	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	44	87	50	12	24	16	233	
589	0	0	0	0	15	0	15	49	42	64	0	52	25	232	
590	0	0	0	0	20	0	20	256	255	402	8	251	156	1328	
591	50	45	55	5	55	-50	160	83	124	133	13	346	211	910	
592	0	0	0	0	20	0	20	22	18	30	0	37	12	119	
593	0	20	100	5	140	45	310	239	221	415	9	321	167	1372	
594	0	0	5	0	30	0	35	69	83	134	0	104	50	440	
595	50	45	50	5	65	-25	190	101	114	156	5	126	17	519	
596	0	0	0	5	40	40	85	21	80	81	5	290	72	549	
597	0	0	0	5	85	40	130	91	329	336	9	478	241	1484	
598	0	0	0	0	10	0	10	29	26	40	0	32	15	142	
599	0	0	0	0	25	0	25	70	58	89	0	177	135	529	
600	0	0	50	10	120	60	240	39	141	193	14	245	116	748	
601	0	0	5	5	55	40	105	64	232	241	9	331	183	1060	
642	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	6	4	31	0	10	5	56	
1468	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	10	6	8	0	1	1	26	
1469	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	66	141	95	0	11	7	320	
1470	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	31	35	179	0	75	50	370	
1471	50	50	0	0	0	0	100	123	59	230	0	34	14	460	
1472	0	0	0	5	20	10	35	8	100	117	5	163	18	411	
1473	0	250	250	0	0	0	500	277	481	498	0	3	6	1265	
1474	-200	25	0	0	0	0	-175	7	156	248	0	3	6	420	
1476	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	162	47	59	0	5	1	274	
1477	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	135	107	33	0	3	1	279	
CITY	1690	6850	4155	65	989	484	14233	7891	18073	17749	134	6376	3595	53818	
2040 totals (ABAG)															52920
2040 totals (ACTC)								7771	16957	16844	133	6163	3563	51431	
GP forecast as percent of 2040 ABAG totals															102%
GP forecast as percent of 2040 ACTC totals															105%

PLAN BAY AREA FORECASTS INDICATE 19% of the employment growth between 2015 and 2040 occurs in 2035-40

Thus to "back in" to 2035 forecasts, each entry in the 2015-2040 increment above should be multiplied by 0.81